

Notice of a meeting of

Corporate Appeals Panel

To: Councillors Galvin, Reid and Funnell

Date: Friday, 20 October 2017

Time: 10.00 am

Venue: The Middleton Room - Ground Floor, West Offices

AGENDA

1. Election of Chair

To elect a Member to act as Chair of the meeting.

2. Exclusion of Press and Public

To consider excluding the public and press from the meeting during consideration of agenda item 5 (Appeal against Dismissal) on the grounds that it contains information relating to an individual and information which is likely to reveal the identity of an individual. This information is classified as exempt under paragraphs 1 and 2 of Schedule 12A to Section 100A of the Local Government Act 1972, as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) Order 2006.

3. Declarations of Interest

At this point, Members are asked to declare any personal interests not included on the Register of Interests, any prejudicial interests or any disclosable pecuniary interests which they may have in respect of business on this agenda.

4. Minutes (Pages 3 - 4)

To approve and sign the minutes of the meeting held on 14 July 2017.

5. Appeal against Dismissal

To consider an appeal against dismissal under the City of York Council Disciplinary Procedure.

a) Management Case (Pages 5 - 12)

Papers in support of Management's case

b) Appellant's Case (Pages 13 - 20)

Papers in support of the appellant's case

c) Joint Supporting Papers (Pages 21 - 172)

Background papers to the appeal

Democracy Officers:

Name: Catherine Clarke and Louise Cook (job share)

Contact Details:

- Telephone – (01904) 551031
- E-mail – catherine.clarke@york.gov.uk and louise.cook@york.gov.uk

(If contacting us by e-mail, please send to both democracy officers named above)

For more information about any of the following please contact the Democracy Officers responsible for servicing this meeting:

- Registering to speak
- Business of the meeting
- Any special arrangements
- Copies of reports and
- For receiving reports in other formats

Contact details are set out above.

This information can be provided in your own language.

我們也用您們的語言提供這個信息 (Cantonese)

এই তথ্য আপনার নিজের ভাষায় দেয়া যেতে পারে। (Bengali)

**Ta informacja może być dostarczona w twoim
własnym języku. (Polish)**

Bu bilgiyi kendi dilinizde almanız mümkündür. (Turkish)

یہ معلومات آپ کی اپنی زبان (بولی) میں بھی مہیا کی جاسکتی ہیں۔ (Urdu)

 (01904) 551550

This page is intentionally left blank

CITY OF YORK COUNCIL
CORPORATE APPEALS PANEL
(Disciplinary Dismissals)

Procedure

The procedure for the appeal will be as follows:

- The appellant and/or his/her representative and the Management (officer(s) appearing for the Council) are invited into the meeting.
- The Chair of the Panel will introduce all parties present and explain procedural matters.
- The Chair will invite the appellant/representative to confirm the reason(s) for the appeal.
- Management will present the Council's case and will call and question any supporting witnesses he/she considers necessary.
- Following the presentation of the Council's case, the Chair will invite the appellant/representative to put questions to Management/witnesses.
- The appellant or his/her representative will present his/her case and will call and question any supporting witnesses he/she considers necessary.
- Following the presentation of the appellant's case, the Chair will invite Management to put questions to the appellant or his/her representative/witnesses.
- Members will ask both parties to sum up (please note that no new evidence can be introduced at this stage)
- Members can asks questions of both parties at any stage during the appeal.

- Any party may call for a reasonable recess during the appeal hearing.
- Once the case for and against the appeal has been heard, the Chair will call for an adjournment for the panel to make their decision.
- Both parties will leave the room while Members, advised by Human Resources, make their decision.

Decision

- Members will debate the case and decide which one or more of the four legal reasons for appeal are applicable.
- Depending on the reason for appeal, Members will decide whether the grounds for appeal are sustained and whether or not to uphold the original decision that the employee did commit a disciplinary offence.
- Members will decide whether or not to uphold the original penalty.
- The reasons for Members decisions will be recorded.
- The outcome of the appeal will be communicated in writing to all parties within five working days of the decision being made.

City of York Council

Committee Minutes

Meeting	Corporate Appeals Panel
Date	14 July 2017
Present	Councillors Galvin, Shepherd and Waller

1. Election of Chair

Resolved: That Councillor Galvin be elected to chair the meeting.

2. Exclusion of Press and Public

Resolved: That the press and public be excluded from the meeting during consideration of agenda item 5 (Appeal against Dismissal) on the grounds that it contains information relating to an individual and information which is likely to reveal the identity of an individual. This information is classified as exempt under paragraphs 1 and 2 of Schedule 12A to Section 100A of the Local Government Act 1972, as revised by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) Order 2006.

3. Declarations of Interest

Members were invited to declare at this point in the meeting any personal interests not included on the Register of Interests, any prejudicial interests or disclosable pecuniary interests which they may have in respect of the business on the agenda. None were declared.

4. Minutes

Resolved: That the minutes of the meeting held on 12 May 2017 be approved as a correct record and then signed by the Chair.

5. Appeal Against Dismissal

The Panel considered an appeal against dismissal under the City of York Council's Disciplinary Procedure.

The hearing was attended by the Assistant Director, Health, Housing and Adult Social Care who presented the management case and an Employee Relations Advisor advising management. The appellant was in attendance at the hearing and was accompanied by a City of York Council work colleague. An HR Business Partner was also in attendance to provide HR advice to the Panel.

The Panel considered all the evidence provided in the agenda papers and verbally at the hearing by both parties, including witness evidence provided in support of management's case at the hearing.

Having considered all the available information, the Panel acknowledged that the allegations were serious enough to constitute Gross Misconduct. However they agreed that, given all the circumstances of the case and the mitigation presented, the penalty of dismissal was too severe and that sufficient mitigation had been presented to lessen the normal sanction of dismissal to a final written warning.

Resolved: That the appeal be upheld.

Reason: The Panel felt that the decision taken by management to dismiss the appellant was too severe given the circumstances of the case.

Councillor J Galvin, Chair

[The meeting started at 10.00 am and finished at 3.00 pm].

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 1, 2 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank